

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

Sabir Hussain

Ph.D. Scholar, Department of Educational Training, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan.

Email: sabirjanmarri@gmail.com

Aqila Hafeez

Ph.D. Scholar, Department of Education, Government College University, Faisalabad.

Email: aqilakaemail@gmail.com

Fakhar Ul Zaman

Ph.D. Scholar, Education Department, Superior University Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan

Email: visiting.fakhar-ul-zaman@uon.edu.pk

Sharoon Sarosh Seerat

Ph.D. Scholar, Department of Education, Government College University, Faisalabad.

Email: sharoonjohnson2019@gmail.com

Received on: 15-10-2023

Accepted on: 18-11-2023

Abstract

The quality of education is essential in the present era; no nation can develop without quality education. In Pakistan, it has been seen that the quality of secondary school-level education is continuously declining. For this purpose, a WhatsApp group of educationists was used to find out the reasons for the quality of education, in which a group discussion was done by asking questions. Thus, a sample of 37 respondents was selected using the responsive sampling method. After the data was collected, different themes were created from the obtained data using thematic analysis methods. Then, based on these results, recommendations were made. From the study discussion, it was concluded that the teachers should be freed from the economic issues first, then should strictly checks and balances with continuous monitoring. It is recommended that dedicated and passionate teachers should be recruited. Support of parents and the community is essential for the quality of education. It is recommended that when training is given to teachers, then there should be proper follow-up. The department will also know how much improvement has occurred after the training.

Keywords: Quality of Education, Secondary Schools, Pakistani Education System, Factor Affecting the Quality of Education, Low Retention at the Secondary School Level.

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

Introduction

There is no widely accepted definition of quality despite the fact that the discussion on quality has been going on for a considerable amount of time. This section examines the definitions that have been provided by various academics, applying them to a variety of circumstances. Both the quality of the education system as a whole (which includes schools and associated entities, teaching and learning environments, policies, and so on) and the quality of what the system provides to students and learners are two factors that make up the quality of education (i.e., quality of teaching and learning process, curriculum, etc.). Examples of terms that have often been used interchangeably include efficiency, effectiveness, equity, and quality (Skedsmo & Huber, 2021). The definition of quality in the context of education is consequently not a simple task.

Based on the currently available literature, it is asserted that the quality debate developed alongside the advent of industrialization. This occurred because the demand for products that conformed to specifications increased, and customers started demanding that they receive value for their money (Anderson, 2023). Through the gradual process of industrialization, mass production and the division of labour into smaller, more repetitive jobs were brought about. As a result, the duty for quality control shifted from people to the processes and systems that companies use. The idea of quality control, under scrutiny up to 1940, quickly began to take over production lines to identify faulty items and prevent them from being sold to consumers. In the decades after World War II, namely in the 1960s, there was a transition from statistical process control to quality assurance. At this point, the primary focus was on preventing the production of faulty items in the first place. This concentration became even more intense, ultimately leading to the idea of total quality management (TQM) in the 1980s (Sadeghi Moghadam et al., 2021; Dewi Anggadini et al., 2021).

With the expansion of social services such as education, health, and defense, which received significant amounts of public funds, the government and communities began to request that the quality of these services be improved in terms of the value that they added to the money. Education was not spared as schools competed with one another for students in order to win their enrollment. Because of this, quality concerns have crossed over into the realm of the public sector and the business world. Furthermore, concepts of quality and service have adapted themselves to meet the specific environments of educational institutions, which has opened the door to the possibility of reforming it in the following century (Busch, 2023; Meyer & Norman, 2020; Hadjichambis & Paraskeva-Hadjichambi, 2020; Lapuente & Van de Walle, 2020).

As stated by Mohan (2023), quality in education is an evaluation process of education that increases the need to achieve and develop the talents of the customers while simultaneously meeting the accountability standards set by the customers who pay for the process. This is a process that enhances the need to achieve and develop the talents of the customers. With regard to the concept of quality, Ali et al. (2021) emphasized that it is simply the fulfillment of consumers' criteria. They have included a variety of clients for education, including both parents and government officials, as well as students, instructors, businesses, and institutions, all of whom are looking for distinct qualities of quality (Garira, 2020).

Considering that education is a service rather than a product, the quality of education cannot be only determined by the ultimate result. The manner in which information is delivered

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

ought to likewise be a manifestation of its excellence. The supply of instructors, buildings, curricula, equipment, textbooks, and teaching methods are all factors that should be taken into consideration when determining the quality of education (Hussain et al., 2022). There is a three-dimensional approach to evaluating the quality of education, which includes the quality of the people and material resources that are available for teaching (inputs), the teaching techniques that are used (process), and the results (outcomes) (Oo, 2019). In addition, he claims that planners often use certain indications, such as the rates of repetition, dropouts, promotions, and transitions, to approximate the program's quality.

On the occasion of the World Conference on Education for All, which took place in Jomtien, Thailand, in the year 1990, it was determined that to accomplish the fundamental objective of equity, the quality of education played a significant role in ensuring children's cognitive development. In its definition of education quality, the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) placed a greater emphasis on "lifelong learning" and "relevance" as the most significant aspects (Oo, 2019). Learning to know, learning to focus on the practical application of what is learned, learning to live together in a community where everyone has an equal opportunity to develop, and learning to emphasize the skills that are necessary for individuals to develop their full potential are the four pillars that form the foundation of education (Ball, 2021; Delors, 1996).

Furthermore, the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) emphasizes the desired aspects of quality outlined in the Dakar Framework. In its paper titled "Defining Quality in Education," the organization acknowledges five aspects of quality: learners, environment, content, processes, and outcomes. These aspects are founded on "the rights of the whole child, and all children, to survival, protection, development, and participation" (UNICEF, 2000). The Communiqué of the World Conference on Higher Education in 2009 stated that "Quality standards must reflect the purpose of nurturing in students the ability to study throughout their lives as well as critical and independent thinking." Innovators and people of different backgrounds should be encouraged (UNESCO, 2009). As a result, it is evident that quality is not a singular idea but encompasses several different points of view.

Education in Pakistan

According to Constitution Article 25A (Eighteenth Amendment 19 April 2010) of Pakistan, 5 to 16 years of education and 1st to 10th education are the responsibilities of the government. According to this rule, education is given free and compulsory. Parents are responsible for sending their children to school. According to Article 25A, if the government fails or ignores any citizen about his/her right, which is free education, then the state can be challenged in court. The latest National Education Policy was announced in 2017, which aims to improve access, quality, and equity in education. The Punjab Free and Compulsory Education Act 2014 was passed. The Higher Education Commission Act 2002 was passed with quality assurance standards. The Private Schools Regulatory Authority Act 2017 was passed. The literacy rate in 1947 was 11% at the time of partition, and in 1951, it was 16.40%, according to the 1st census. In 1961, it was 16.30% according to the 2nd census; in 1972, it was 21.70% according to the 3rd census; in 1981 was 26.20% according to the 4th census; in 1998, was 43.90% according to the 5th census; in 2017 was 59% according to 6th census and 2022-23 was as Economic survey report of Pakistan 62.3% (Wikipedia contributors, 2023; Umar et al., 2023;

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

Khan et al., 2019).

Article 37B, passed by the National Assembly on 10 April 1973 and enacted on 12 April 1973, suggests free and compulsory education from 1st to 10th class within the minimum possible periods. According to this Article, there is no restriction or limit on age, gender, caste, religion, or social background status. Article 37B discusses the right to education, and Article 25A strengthens it and makes education a justiciable right of every citizen, making it a challenge against the state in court (Khan et al., 2019).

The Constitution's 18th Amendment was a crucial step toward quality education in Pakistan. School education was decentralized from the federal to the provincial level. According to this Amendment, the provincial government has the authority to set its educational policy and curriculum. With this authority, the provincial government can include the local language in the curriculum, making education easy and understandable. With this authority, the provincial government now arranges education resources and makes education more innovative. The provincial government now regulates private education and ensures quality education. The provincial government is responsible for school infrastructure and conducts teacher training programs. With this Amendment, education became provincial education (Siddiqui et al., 2021).

The Single National Curriculum (SNC) was also a step towards quality education in Pakistan and was introduced by the PTI government under Prime Minister Imran Khan. The single National Curriculum was introduced in 2018. The Single National Curriculum covers all core subjects like Urdu, English, Mathematics, Science and Islamiyat from grades 1st to 12th. SNC aims to reduce disparity and enhance the quality of education. The Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training (MoFEPT) established a committee to develop the SNC curriculum with core priority from 2019 to 2022. SNC was pilot-tested across the country and launched in 2021 officially from grades 1st to 5th all over the country, but the Sindh government refused to implement it. The provincial government uses the provincial autonomy given by the 18th Amendment; Sindh educationists said that SNC ignored the regional languages and cultures in the curriculum; also, there are no resources for teacher training (Abbas et al., 2022).

Statement of the Problem

Pakistani education at the secondary school level is facing significant problems and challenges and not providing good opportunities to students. Due to this, there is a huge difference in gender access and retention to education; the female rate is alarmingly low in the villages, and the dropout rate is very high. Secondary education is the backbone of Pakistan, and after that, many children drop out. There are many financial, regional and linguistic issues to drop out. Therefore, it is important that the quality of education at the secondary level should be high and sustainable. In quality education, teachers and headmasters play a very important role; the teacher is a guide and motivator. Good supervision of the headmaster and good utilization of resources improve the quality of education to a great extent. Due to a lack of coaching by teachers, students do rote learning, which causes them to lack critical and positive thinking. Our education system is producing neither good intellectuals nor skilled persons. In the last decade, a lot of work was done on out-of-school children; many education reforms were introduced, and the private sector was

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

also included, which improved the literacy rate slightly, but while improving it, the quality of education became zero. For many years, students have been unable to pass any further admission tests even after scoring very good marks in matriculation. Due to low quality and modern requirements, the Pakistani education system is not producing skilled persons in society, and there is no maturity in the attitudes of students. In this urgent situation, there is a dire need to discuss secondary education in Pakistan, and suggestions are needed. Researchers have thought of researching this issue, and this paper is a part of the effort.

Objectives of the Study

The objectives of this research were as follows;

1. To discuss the reasons for low access and low retention of secondary school education in Pakistan and to critically evaluate the factors affecting the quality.
2. To review the role of teachers and headmasters in the quality of education at the secondary school level.
3. Examining the role of parents and community at the secondary school level.
4. Give suggestions to control the problems and increase the quality of education.

Research questions.

1. Why the secondary school level access and retention rate is low in Pakistan?
2. What are the factors affecting the quality of education in secondary school?
3. How do teachers and headmasters increase education quality at the secondary school level?
4. What is the role of curriculum, students, parents and community members in the quality of education at the secondary school level?

Literature Review

Instructors are an essential component of a high-quality education, and teachers who have received professional training have the potential to make a substantial contribution to the improvement of educational standards. In addition to the professional education that teachers get, the experience and personality of the instructors also have a significant influence. This is due to the fact that pupils like and look up to their teachers, seeing them as their ideal and role models (Hussain, 2021). The children will develop into creative thinkers like Aristotle, who was a student of Plato; Aristotle challenged some of his teacher's ideas and presented his own contemporary ideas, which led to critical thinking. If the teacher possesses a great deal of ability, then the children will develop creative thinking (Hussain, 2023; Amir et al., 2022).

Furthermore, a competent administration has a substantial influence on the production of high-quality educational opportunities (Díez et al., 2020). Because the principal is responsible for ensuring that a school meets its academic criteria, the leader of the school should have a great deal of experience and education in order to have a comprehensive understanding of the situation (Stronge & Xu, 2021). Every activity that takes place in the classroom is supervised by a capable and active administrator, who also makes certain that every student receives an outstanding education (Yusuf et al., 2020). In situations when the academic threshold is already high, the headmaster or mistress will increase it to a level that

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

is in accordance with international norms. Therefore, having capable administrators is essential for a school to be successful (Kalkan et al., 2020).

Due to the fact that it is crucial for a school to be equipped with all of the required goods, the physical environment of a school is an essential component for a proper education. The first thing that has to be done in order to achieve great education is to make sure that the environment that students are in at school is one that is warm and inviting. It is of the utmost importance to provide the basic needs of the kid, which include providing access to clean drinking water, a restroom, a room with enough ventilation, proper lighting, temperature and humidity management, and protection from excessive noise. It is necessary to have a sufficient number of rooms available (Umar et al., 2023; Lian, 2020). Accurate measurements are required for the perimeter wall that surrounds the school in order to guarantee the best possible degree of safety for both the pupils and the teachers. The school needs to have a decent facade, with the walls being at the appropriate height level and the installation of closed-circuit video cameras all around the facility. Additionally, educational institutions have to be given the responsibility of providing proper janitorial services (Hafeez et al., 2023; Asad et al., 2023).

Because it is important for children to be able to participate in both football and cricket, the playground at the school should have enough area for both of these games. In addition, the school needs to have a cafeteria that provides food and other refreshments of good quality and at costs that are reasonable, and the pricing ought to be reasonable (Hussain, 2021; Kumaraswamy & Gasti, 2021). It is also recommended that the school be equipped with a photocopying machine, bookbinders, and a stationery store. In order to calculate the proper staffing level at the institution, the number of students and courses at the school should be taken into consideration. It is essential that the school facilitates students' participation in physical education programs by providing them with the necessary resources (Zaman et al., 2023; O'Connor & Penney, 2021). In addition to that, it should give its pupils a contemporary library, a scientific laboratory, and a computer lab; the computer lab should be linked to the internet. Additionally, the school needs to include a meeting room in addition to an examination hall. Both of these facilities are essential. The provision of first aid kits and supplies that are easily accessible is an essential need for educational institutions. All of these variables lead to an improvement in the quality of education (Hussain et al., 2023; Viner et al., 2022).

Educational experiences that take place outside of the classroom are a crucial component of a well-rounded education (Alam et al., 2022). It is thus possible for the teacher of children's physical education to also act as the coach for any sports that the children engage in. Children should be able to play cricket and football on the school grounds, which should be large enough to accommodate such activities, and the school should give such possibilities (Paudyal & Rijal, 2022; Fowlie et al., 2021). It is essential that the school be furnished with a broad assortment of athletic products and that a designated area be made available for the use of these items. Additionally, educational programming should be carried out, and youngsters should be taken to historical locations at appropriate times. In light of the fact that Aristotle believed that a healthy body was associated with a healthy mind, it is imperative that children's physical education be regulated in an appropriate manner. Activities such as Girl Guides, Boy Scout organizations, and athletic contests with other schools must be made

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

available (Hussain, 2021; Umar et al., 2023).

The atmosphere of a school is an important factor in determining the level of education that students get. The atmosphere of the school must be conducive to the development of a constructive social and educational atmosphere. This is of the utmost importance. When the environment at the school is upbeat and supportive, it will have a significant impact not only on the academic achievement of the children but also on their overall growth and development for the kids. Any and all instances of physical violence should be eradicated from the school environment, and the environment should be one that is friendly to students (Hussain et al., 2022). In order to create an atmosphere that is friendly and inviting across the whole institution, it is essential for students to get along well with one another and with their instructors (Komalasari et al., 2020).

Research Methodology

This study was a qualitative and cross-sectional survey. Its data was collected through group discussion. For this purpose, a group of educationists was selected, in which people were preparing to be recruited as Senior Headmasters, Senior Subject Specialists, Lecturers, or Assistant Professors. Then, the research questions were shared in the group, and a discussion was held for a week; the point of view of each educationist was recorded and included in the study. The data was written down, and the methods of qualitative data analysis were used; the best and most suitable method was chosen for interpretation, which was the thematic analysis method, and then different themes were created. The data were put into these themes, and the results were extracted. Then, based on these results, suggestions for improvement were given.

Population and Sample of the Study

There was a total of 86 male and female educationists in the WhatsApp group, who were M. Phil. and Ph.D. scholars teaching in different schools in Pakistan and in this group, they came together to study educational research for their preparation of tests for good and higher post like Senior Headmaster, Senior SS Education or Lecturer Education. Discussions of 37 participants were recorded using a responsive sampling technique, of which 55% responded by female and 45% by male educationists. Therefore, the total sample of the study was considered to be 37 participants. Responsive sampling is a very good technique for survey research and has been used in many studies (Tourangeau et al., 2017). This saves time and money, as well as eliminates the bias of responding inadvertently. In the past, this technique was used to collect data by calling, texting, or emailing, but researchers keeping the new technology in mind used WhatsApp groups and collected data through open discussion.

Instrument

Open-ended interview questions were asked to collect data, asking why the access and retention rate is low at the secondary school level. What are the factors affecting the quality of education at the secondary school level? What is the role of teachers and headmasters in the quality of education? What is the role of curriculum, students, parents, and community in the quality of education? These questions were discussed in the WhatsApp group and were validated by experts and heads of secondary schools.

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

Data Collection Method

Questions were asked to educationists in a WhatsApp group, and open discussion was conducted; valid responses were recorded, thus collected authentic and unbiased data for the research study by consent of all educators.

Data Interpretation

After collecting the data, it was arranged. Then, different themes were created, like teacher-related, headmaster-related, parent-related, child-related, and curriculum-related themes. A separate theme was created for the remaining data, named Remaining Issues. The data was carefully categorized into these themes, and recommendations were drawn based on this.

Discussion and Results of the Study

Group Discussion

1. The quality of education at the secondary level in Pakistan is low because children are not exposed to practical. Secondary education should be correlated with choral life. When it correlates with practical life, its quality will automatically increase.
2. The quality of education at the secondary level is low because rote learning is done here. No doubt, rote learning is the basis of critical thinking, but the time is too short for children to do critical thinking. When the rote learning system has to be changed, the quality of education at the secondary level will be improved, for this teacher can play an essential role. Teachers are the natural change agents.
3. The quality of education at the secondary level is low because the teachers do not teach seriously. In the past, teachers had no other job than teaching, but in today's era, the problems of teachers have increased so much with low pay that they cannot fulfil all their responsibilities properly.
4. The quality of education at the secondary level is low because the old curriculum is being taught. The curriculum the grandfather taught is the same curriculum the grandchildren are studying. However, in the modern era, the education system should be changed; the teachers are also tired of teaching the old curriculum. One of the main reasons is that the medium of education has changed repeatedly and speedily, and many experiments have been employed. There is a great reason to downsize.
5. One of the reasons for the low quality of education at the secondary level is that there is no proper check and balance; the officers of the inspection team are promotee officers and old teachers, and they protect senior teachers because they are their Colleagues or ex-partners or have previous friendships.
6. One of the main reasons for the low quality of education at the secondary level is that the promotion of teachers is not linked to their performance. If the annual increment of the teachers is subject to their performance, the teachers will teach seriously, and the quality of education will be increased.
7. Government teachers are only interested in salary; they are not concerned with the needs of children.
8. Education without following quality standards to meet the upcoming level (To meet results as a figure, not quality sustainability) has no quality.
9. Teachers' ethics have played a significant role in the student's result; it's my

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

experience. My subject is biology, but our school has no mathematics teacher. I taught mathematics in classes 9,10 with passionately and got 100% results.

10. Teachers are the king of the class; whatever the curriculum is, if he is versatile and dedicated, he can give the best results. However, he will not get any results if he teaches the best curriculum without interest.

11. There should be teacher support and an educational environment. In Pakistan, teachers are not supported, and the community does not respect teachers but humiliates them, due to which the teacher does not teach with heart. If the teacher reaches school five minutes late, the problem is not solved. Still, it is criticized that the teacher is not hardworking, the society cannot offer a glass of water to the teacher, it heaps criticism, and therefore, the teachers are tolerant and teach the children. Do not teach from the heart; the anger of a miscreant person spills over to the entire class, which lowers the quality of education. For the quality of education, it is important not to torture the teacher mentally but to keep the teacher always happy.

12. As many issues exist in our education system, I don't think that solving one-half of them will improve the quality of education; teacher training at the matric level is not at all. The student-teacher ratio is very high, and there is an urgent need to reduce the STR. The syllabus is very lengthy, and due to sudden holidays, teachers try to cover the syllabus in a hurry, which results in the loss of quality education. Funds for AV aids are very low due to teachers teaching using old, outdated methods, which has caused quality education to become zero and students' concepts to be unclear.

13. Poverty is also one of the primary reasons for the low quality of education at the secondary level. Due to a lack of resources, teachers cannot give good results in the 9th and 10th classes. Children have neither copy nor pencil to write. Old guidebooks are read by children who have read three or four years ago by other children, and these guides have many names of students, curly marks, circles by pencils, ink spots, and half pages; how can such books provide quality education?

14. Teachers must be dedicated and committed to improving quality at the secondary level. Teachers are not committed at all. The quality of education cannot improve until teachers teach from the heart. Teachers should teach students as their children.

15. The fear of God has disappeared in the hearts of the teachers; the teachers must be religious to create the fear of God. The teacher prays five times, has a beard, fears God, cries, and always has this fear in their hearts that God is watching; if I do not teach the children correctly, what will I answer to God when the teachers have this fear in their hearts, the quality of education will automatically increase.

16. Students in the government sector are highly dependent on teachers, especially in rural areas. Therefore, the quality of education mostly depends on the teaching skills of the teachers. If the teachers have good teaching skills, the quality of education will significantly increase.

17. For the quality of education, it is essential to motivate the students and remove the fear of teachers from their hearts by counseling them so that when they do not understand, they stop the teacher and clarify the concept. I have such an environment in my class. It has been produced, and excellent results are being obtained. Usually, the government teacher writes the question on the board, solves it, and leaves the classroom without further

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

discussion, and the students don't get a chance to speak about whether they have understood something.

18. Focus only on three areas;

a. The teacher must be paid an attractive package (salary and additional incentive) and independent (having powers, i.e., reward, punishment, fine, rustication, the teacher must be given all resources related to teaching and addressing pupils' problems, personal economic, etc.).

b. Providing all the above facilities to Honorable teachers, he must be strictly monitored, rewarded, and punished.

c. Teachers must be given veto-type rights when finalizing policies and education matters.

19. Passionate leadership is mandatory. Without leadership and passion, the quality of education is nothing. Unfortunately, the teacher is the backbone of management, but we don't consider it so far as he executes all the policymaker plans.

20. Increase the government teacher's salary as much as you want, but still, he will not teach. If he is given full freedom, he will also do the personal work of his house from the students. The only solution is to completely stop the pay of poor performers. There should also be strict checks and balances.

21. There are no refresher courses at the secondary level; if there is a refresher course, there is no good training, teachers come back gossiping, no assessment, and no projects are made. Teachers get Honorary and refreshments in core refresher courses.

22. A person who performs his duties well is God's masterpiece" (Hazrat Umar Farooq). Quality education can increase from headteacher to a single teacher, from policymakers to curriculum developers, if all stakeholders do their duty well. Dutifulness is the key to success. Quality of education can be achieved according to the words of Hazrat Umar Farooq.

23. If the principal is strict and does all the work under his supervision, then quality of education can be achieved. But the problem is that the principal is also a government employee interested in money, not work. Most principals do not come to the school; they use the excuse of office for some official meeting and are often absent.

24. The principal should teach the classes, but here, the principal reverses the workload on the teachers. How many principals teach classes themselves, only ten to twelve percent; thus, the quality of education does not increase.

25. There is a problem with combining the medium of language and other subjects at the matriculation level. Still, science does not have proper laboratory equipment, and there is no adequate method of teacher training.

26. The system itself is not right from the higher level; stop the salary of the teachers when they do not have money to teach their children in private schools, and the result of government schools will automatically improve.

27. If good laboratories are given to the schools, the teachers will not even clean the dust of the instruments. No matter how much training is done, there will be no benefit; the only solution is to stop the teachers' salaries.

28. A right-stop salary is one of the best options for teachers who have not performed their duties accurately.

29. There are many reasons for low quality, such as teachers not performing their duties

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

properly, and most teachers are interested in teaching other than the duties that bring extra income. The syllabus also needs to change; it is outdated. But I know the most important thing is education up to the primary level or till the third grade; if the child is taught to understand the topic, write, read, and ask questions, then the child will progress further. The number of students is high, and children need individual attention at this level, so recruit new teachers and remove the STR. Due to the large number, less space, and fewer teachers, the education and learning process does not occur in a suitable environment.

30. A child can neither take a pencil, copy, nor love; these are all factors of low-quality education.

31. Teachers using mobile phones.

32. Having local teachers at the elementary and secondary level, the headmaster does not have the authority involvement of the community. Local communities themselves are blackmailers. I am the head of an elementary school and facing all these difficulties. Women, i.e., mothers of children, come to school with complaints, teachers are afraid of women, so they do not say anything to children, and spoiled children do not study again. Nowadays, the job situation is such that the spirit of competition among the children is also disappearing and the parents are not serious about the children's educational matters—lack of awareness.

33. The harmful effect of peer groups and bad societies of children and criminal society badly affects quality education. Political pressure from tribal rules. Parents' professional work. Lack of parent's education. Source of convincing due to far school. Instability condition of the family. Encourage and give feedback—on social and cultural values.

34. Then why respected teachers don't want to do unpaid training, although most of the training is during school hours and the duties they do in addition to the training or teaching, in which they get paid, they reach as far away as they want, teachers' behaviour is not favourable, there was online English training last month, so respected teachers gave money to unemployed people to solve the exercises. They don't want to do anything themselves; they give money and solve the training exercises.

35. One of the reasons for the low quality of education at the secondary level may be that parents have too many children; they are well looked after at the primary school level, but when they reach the secondary school level, they become victims of parental inattention., Although there is a lot of money, there is no parental care.

36. Our system has no inclusive education; if there is an inclusive system, there is no proper system for inclusive assessment.

37. The main reason behind the low quality of education at the secondary level is that after primary education, students reach a level of age where they learn any skill and become the earning hand for their parents.

Thematic Analysis

All interviews were thematically analyzed, and the following results were obtained;

Teacher related factors

1. Teachers not being dedicated and committed.
2. Teachers are being paid too little and doing other jobs due to economic problems.
3. Lack of training at the secondary level and teachers teaching in traditional ways.

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

4. Lack of motivation and passion among teachers.
5. Not fearing Allah, lack of teaching skills, using mobile phones, not fearing monitoring or friendship of teachers with officers.
6. Undermine the self-esteem of teachers by the community or officials.
7. Unnecessary harassment of teachers by the community in rural areas. High student-teacher ratio. Rote teaching. The lengthy syllabus and the arrival of the unexpected holidays.
8. There is a severe lack of AV aids, the strict attitude of teachers, and students not asking any questions from teachers—policymakers' non-involvement of teachers.
9. Having local teachers, complaints from parents about scolding children, teachers not considering students as their children. Children of teachers being in private schools.

Factors related to the headmaster

1. The headmaster himself is busy with other activities; he does not come to school, does not teach any class, takes all the work from the teachers, and plays mobile phone all day.
2. Promotion of teachers is not linked to their performance; there is no assessment of teachers, no self-monitoring of teachers, and no proper use of the budget.
3. They are not stopping the salary of teachers for poor performance, mentally torturing teachers, not forcing teachers to use AV aids, not encouraging good teachers, or rewarding them.
4. There is an absence of headteacher refresher courses, pressure from the headmaster's local community, political pressure, and pressure from villagers in some areas.
5. Principals are promotee, not selected by any standardized channels; old principals lack passion or interest, and there is a lack of young principals.

Curriculum-related factors

1. At the secondary level, only theories are taught and practical teaching is zero. Education should be closer to real life. Rote learning is a huge problem; the curriculum is so old that children are forced into rote learning.
2. Frequent changes in the medium of instructions, new experiments on education, lack of training and refresher courses for teachers, and no training in any new teaching methods in refresher courses.
3. Failure of schools to follow quality standards, lack of quality in books, unnecessary long syllabus, and a mixture of languages like Urdu, English, Latin, Greek, and Arabic in the syllabus.
4. Lack of science laboratories, lack of equipment, lack of training of teachers to use the equipment. Lack of inclusive education, lack of inclusive assessment.

Factors associated with children and parents

1. Children do not have a pen and copy to write, distance school from home, sitting in dirty parties, excessive use of mobile phones, and parents' inattention.
2. Rote learning children instead of critical thinking.
3. They do not ask questions from the teacher due to fear, do not stop the teacher if they don't understand, perform the personal work of the teacher, and have overcrowded classes.
4. Parents have too many children. The inattention of parents or having professional

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

jobs, parents being uneducated.

5. Parents harass teachers, humiliate teachers, blackmail teachers, and complain about teachers.
6. Domestic problems, move residence from one place to another.
7. Children become helping hands for their parents after primary education.

Remaining issues

1. Extreme poverty, lack of jobs.
2. The education system changing frequently.
3. There is no promotion of teachers; teachers are busy preparing for competitive exams for better jobs.
4. The entire education system of Pakistan is running only on WhatsApp and other social media; practically no progress is being made, and the education system is limited only to paperwork.
5. The humiliation of teachers, blackmailing of accusations on teachers by the community, the humiliation of teachers by officers, bribery in offices, and salary-related works of teachers not being done on time.
6. The intervention of political education ministers, frequent change of political leaders, less allocation of funds, and giving schools to private institutions.
7. There is no formal organization for formal training, no inclusion of new teaching methods in the policy, no mentoring of teachers, no freedom for teachers to use new teaching methods and co-curricular activities, and interference from illiterate or semi-literate parents.
8. Lack of guidance and counseling in schools.

Recommendations

According to the findings, some following recommendations were made;

1. It is recommended that teachers should be relieved of financial problems and their salaries should be increased.
2. It is suggested that secondary-level process training be conducted so that teachers can learn a new pedagogical skill, followed by monitoring in the classroom so that teachers can move away from old teaching methods and start teaching in new ways.
3. It is recommended that parents, community, and officials respect teachers and stop humiliating them. A teacher cannot teach when they are mentally tortured.
4. It is suggested to keep the student-teacher ratio standard, fill the gap by recruiting new teachers, and reduce the syllabus as more holidays are given due to worse country conditions and the syllabus is not covered properly.
5. It is recommended that there should be strict checks and balances for teachers, and salaries should be stopped for low performance.
6. It is endorsed that teachers should be promoted to the next scale every year according to education and experience so that they do not have to read books by the Public Service Commission for better jobs.
7. It is recommended that the headmaster should be recruited from the Public Service Commission, the officers of the Education Office should also be recruited from the Public Service Commission, and promoted teachers should not be appointed as officers.

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

8. It is recommended that when training is given to teachers, then there should be proper follow-up. The department will also know how much improvement has occurred after the training.

References

1. Abbas, A., Basit, I., Akhtar, M., Mehmood, U., & Nazim, F. (2022). Single National Curriculum at School Level in Pakistan: Expected Challenges, Merits, And Demerits. *PPalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, 19(3), 48-65.
2. Alam, A. (2022). Mapping a sustainable future through conceptualization of transformative learning framework, education for sustainable development, critical reflection, and responsible citizenship: an exploration of pedagogies for twenty-first century learning. *ECS Transactions*, 107(1), 9827.
3. Ali, B. J., Saleh, P. F., Akoi, S., Abdulrahman, A. A., Muhamed, A. S., Noori, H. N., & Anwar, G. (2021, May). Impact of service quality on the customer satisfaction: Case study at online meeting platforms. In Ali, BJ, Saleh, Akoi, S., Abdulrahman, AA, Muhamed, AS, Noori, HN, Anwar, G. (2021). *Impact of Service Quality on the Customer Satisfaction: Case study at Online Meeting Platforms. International journal of Engineering, Business and Management* (Vol. 5, No. 2, pp. 65-77).
4. Amir, M., Hussain, S., & Muhammad, S. (2022). Identification of the Need for Teacher Training at The Primary School Level. *International Research Journal of Education and Innovation*, 3(1), 165-176.
5. Anderson, B. M. (2023). *The value of money*. Good Press.
6. Asad, A., Mehmood, S., Hussain, S., & Amir, M. (2023). Analysis of Risk Management in Higher Education Institution. *International Research Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 4(3), 282-288.
7. Ball, S. J. (2021). *The education debates*. Policy Press.
8. Busch, L. (2023). *Knowledge for sale: The neoliberal takeover of higher education*. MIT Press.
9. Delors, J. (1996). *The four pillars of education*.
10. Dewi Anggadini, S., Lnu, S., Saepudin, A., & Subhan Saleh, D. (2021). Business performance and implementation of total quality management: A case study in Indonesia. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 8(5).
11. Díez, F., Villa, A., López, A. L., & Iraurgi, I. (2020). Impact of quality management systems in the performance of educational centers: educational policies and management processes. *Heliyon*, 6(4).
12. Fowlie, J., Eime, R. M., & Griffiths, K. (2021). Barriers to adolescent female participation in cricket. *Annals of leisure research*, 24(4), 513-531.
13. Garira, E. (2020). A proposed unified conceptual framework for quality of education in schools. *Sage Open*, 10(1), 2158244019899445.
14. Hadjichambis, A. C., & Paraskeva-Hadjichambi, D. (2020). Education for environmental citizenship: The pedagogical approach. *Conceptualizing environmental citizenship for 21st century education*, 4, 237-261.
15. Hafeez, A., Hussain, S., Muhammad, S., & Hussain, S. (2023). Effect of PEC Exams on Quality Education in Public and Punjab Education Foundation Funded Secondary Schools. *International Research Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 4(3), 358-374.
16. Hussain, S. (2021). Quality of Education in Public and Daanish Schools at Secondary Level. *International Research Journal of Education and Innovation*, 2(2), 160-169.
17. Hussain, S., Abbas, Q., & Ahmad, A. (2022). Comparative Analyses of Environmental Risk Management at Secondary Schools Level in Punjab and its Effect on Students' Academic Achievement. *International Research Journal of Education and Innovation*, 3(4), 36-49.

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

18. Hussain, S., Ahmad, M. S., & Hussain, S. (2022). Relationship of Teacher-Student Interaction, Learning Commitment and Student Learning Comfort at Secondary Level. *International Research Journal of Education and Innovation*, 3(2), 156-169.
19. Hussain, S., Ahmad, M., Altaf, H. S., & Ahmad, M. F. (2022). Quality of Education in Public and Punjab Education Foundation Funded Schools at Secondary Level. *Journal of Research & Reflections in Education (JRRE)*, 16(2).
20. Hussain, S., Ahmad, M., Zaman, F. U., & Ahmad, A. (2023). Comparative Study of Administrators' Supervisory Skills and Teachers' Pedagogical Skills Towards Quality Education in Public and Punjab Education Foundation Funded Schools at Secondary Level. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 10(2), 329-347.
21. Hussain, S., Zaman, F. U., Muhammad, S., & Hafeez, A. (2023). Analysis of the Initiatives taken by HEC to Implement Associate Degree Program: Opportunities and Challenges. *International Research Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 4(3), 193-210.
22. Kalkan, Ü., Altınay Aksal, F., Altınay Gazi, Z., Atasoy, R., & Dağlı, G. (2020). The relationship between school administrators' leadership styles, school culture, and organizational image. *Sage Open*, 10(1), 2158244020902081.
23. Khan, F. N., Mirza, N., & Kanwal, S. (2019). The Impact of Constitutional Provisions for Education on the Overall Literacy: A Comparative Study of Pakistan and South Korea. *Sir Syed Journal of Education & Social Research*, 3(4), 171-188.
24. Komalasari, K., Arafat, Y., & Mulyadi, M. (2020). Principal's management competencies in improving the quality of education. *Journal of social work and Science Education*, 1(2), 181-193.
25. Kumaraswamy, K., & Gasti, A. M. (2021). Analysis of Physical Education and Sport Facilities in Training Colleges of Karnataka State. *International Journal of Yogic Human Movement and Sport Sciences*, 6(1), 71-83.
26. Lapuente, V., & Van de Walle, S. (2020). The effects of new public management on the quality of public services. *Governance*, 33(3), 461-475.
27. Lian, B. (2020). Giving creativity room to students through the friendly school's program.
28. Liao, H., Toya, K., Lepak, D. P., & Hong, Y. (2009). Do they see eye to eye? Management and employee perspectives of high-performance work systems and influence processes on service quality. *Journal of applied psychology*, 94(2), 371.
29. Meyer, M. W., & Norman, D. (2020). Changing design education for the 21st century. *She Ji: The Journal of Design, Economics, and Innovation*, 6(1), 13-49.
30. Mohan, R. (2023). *Measurement, evaluation and assessment in education*. PHI Learning Pvt. Ltd.
31. O'Connor, J., & Penney, D. (2021). Informal sport and curriculum futures: An investigation of the knowledge, skills and understandings for participation and the possibilities for physical education. *European Physical Education Review*, 27(1), 3-26.
32. Oo, M. (2019). *Principals' and Teachers' Perceptions on Factors Affecting Quality Education at the Selected Basic Education High Schools in Sagaing* (Doctoral dissertation, MERAL Portal).
33. Paudyal, T. R., & Rijal, N. (2022). Case Study on the sports Facilities: Naharpur Public Secondary School and Glory English Private Secondary School of Butwal Sub-Metropolitan City.
34. Sadeghi Moghadam, M. R., Safari, H., & Yousefi, N. (2021). Clustering quality management models and methods: systematic literature review and text-mining analysis approach. *Total Quality Management & Business Excellence*, 32(3-4), 241-264.
35. Siddiqui, M. S., Ahmed, Z., & Memon, A. (2021). Impact of devolution on education in Pakistan in the light of 18th Amendment: A review article. *The Government-Annual Research Journal of Political Science*.
36. Skedsmo, G., & Huber, S. G. (2021). What does educational quality mean? *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability*, 33, 587-589.
37. Stronge, J. H., & Xu, X. (2021). *Qualities of effective principals*. ASCD.

Why Quality of Education is Low at the Secondary Level in Pakistan: A Group Discussion

38. Tourangeau, R., Michael Brick, J., Lohr, S., & Li, J. (2017). Adaptive and responsive survey designs: a review and assessment. *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society Series A: Statistics in Society*, 180(1), 203-223.
39. Umar, Z., Hussain, S., Khan, I., & Perveen, F. (2023). Parents' Involvement Effect on Students' Academic Achievement and Quality Education in Public and Private Schools at Elementary Level. *International Research Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 4(3), 400-411.
40. Umar, Z., Sadiqi, T., Hussain, S., & Qahar, A. (2023). Compare the Quality of Infrastructure on Student Outcomes in Public and Punjab Education Foundation Funded Schools at Secondary Level. *International Research Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 4(4), 26-39.
41. UNESCO. (2009). *World conference on higher education: The new dynamics of higher education and research for societal change and development* held in Paris, 5-8 July 2009. Draft Communiqué (1st Draft 26 June 2009), ED.2009/CONF.402/2.
42. UNICEF, I. (2000, June). Defining quality in education. In *A paper presented by UNICEF at the meeting of The International Working Group on Education Florence, Italy June*.
43. Viner, R., Russell, S., Saulle, R., Croker, H., Stansfield, C., Packer, J., ... & Minozzi, S. (2022). School closures during social lockdown and mental health, health behaviors, and well-being among children and adolescents during the first COVID-19 wave: a systematic review. *JAMA pediatrics*.
44. Wikipedia contributors. (2023, December 25). *Education in Pakistan*. Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Education_in_Pakistan.
45. Yusuf, M., Fitria, H., & Mulyadi, M. (2020). The Influence of Teacher's Supervision and Professionalism on Teacher's Performance. *Journal of Social Work and Science Education*, 1(3), 234-240.
46. Zaman, F. U., Muhammad, S., Hussain, S., & Qahar, A. (2023). Challenges and Risks for Higher Education Now and Beyond the 2030. *International Research Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 4(3), 180-192.