

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment with National Education Policies in Pakistani Affiliated Colleges

Dr. Allah Wasaya Babbar
EST English Ghss Qasba Gujrat, Pakistan.

Dr. Nemat Ullah
Assistant Professor, Govt. Graduate College Kot Addu, Pakistan.

Faiz Mahmood
M.Phil Chemistry, University of Education Lahore, D.G. Khan (Campus)

Dr. Muhammad Ahsan
Assistant Professor, Department of English, Ghazi University Dera Ghazi Khan,
Pakistan.
Email: mahsan@gudgk.edu.pk

Received on: 23-07-2023

Accepted on: 26-08-2023

Abstract

This research study focuses on Pakistani-affiliated institutions in a variety of provinces, including Sindh, Punjab, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK), and Balochistan, to explore the alignment between vision, mission and goals and national education policy in Pakistan. This study's objective is to investigate how educators in each of these regions feel about the degree to which their vision, mission, and goals are aligned, as well as how easy it is for them to obtain relevant materials. The study was descriptive in nature. The population of the study was all the principals; faculty members of affiliated colleges were the population of the study. A total of 1900 colleges are registered under the affiliation of different degree-awarding institutions in Pakistan. The study was survey type while the sample was selected through the convenience sampling method of non-probability sampling. Total of 140 faculty members (80 from Punjab (the largest province in terms of population), 20 from Sindh, 20 from KP, and 20 from Balochistan, while 28 principals and 28 directors QEC were selected as samples of the study. The questionnaires were used to determine the effectiveness of the parameters of modified minimum quality standards; moreover, the questionnaires were used to highlight/ explore the deficient areas in MQS for further deliberation/incorporation. The questionnaires were administered to the principals and faculty members of affiliating colleges. An interview protocol was prepared based on minimum quality standards and was used to gather data from principals of affiliated colleges. The study results further identified the problems and

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

issues facing the affiliated educational institutions of Pakistan. Most of the participants have little idea and understanding of the first standards Vision, Mission and Goals set by affiliated colleges. Further, this study identified that affiliated colleges had implemented the rules and regulations regarding academic programs and evaluations provided by affiliating universities. However, the rules are not being implemented as desired.

Keywords: vision, mission, goals, education policies alignment etc.

Introduction

In realm of education, one of the most important factors that determines the overall level of quality and efficiency of the educational system is the degree to which educational institutions' missions, visions, and overall goals are congruent with those of the larger national education policies (Brimble & Whiting, 2006). In this study, a comparative investigation of the alignment between the vision, mission, and goals of Pakistani affiliated colleges and the national education policy is investigated in depth. By analyzing this alignment, we hope to acquire a better understanding of the degree to which these institutions are operating in accordance with the overarching educational goals stated by the nation.

The landscape of higher education in Pakistan is significantly shaped by the country's network of affiliated colleges. These colleges are frequently associated with universities, but they function in a manner that is somewhat autonomous of such universities. They make a significant contribution to the tertiary education sector of the country (GoP, 2009). The ability of these universities to integrate its mission, vision, and goals with the more comprehensive education policy of the country is directly related to the quality and relevance of the education that is offered there. This alignment not only has an effect on the learning process, but it also helps move the country closer to accomplishing the educational goals it has set for itself (HEC, 2017).

Primary education, middle education, secondary education, higher secondary education, and postsecondary education are the several stages that make up Pakistan's multi-tiered educational system. The overall goals of the system are to encourage literacy and skill development while also providing access to education for all citizens (HEC, 2020). In order to provide a framework for the continued growth and enhancement of the country's educational system, the government of Pakistan has articulated its education policies in a number of papers, one of which is the National Education Policy (Al-Qayoudhi et al., 2017). The landscape of higher education in Pakistan is notable for the significant role that affiliated colleges play (Hussain & Ali, 2018). These colleges are affiliated with universities, although they retain a certain degree of operational independence from the universities to which they belong. They provide a variety of undergraduate and even occasionally postgraduate programs, spanning a wide variety of academic fields. Because of their affiliation with the universities, they are able to make use of the intellectual resources and frameworks that are made available by the universities while still maintaining a certain degree of autonomy in their operations (Kousar & Asif, 2015).

The expansion of access to higher education in Pakistan is significantly aided by the efforts of these colleges, particularly in areas of the country where universities may not have a physical presence. They make it possible for students to pursue higher education without having to

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

move to a campus located at a traditional institution of higher learning. The Higher Education Commission of Pakistan (HEC) typically establishes the regulations that must be followed and the quality control procedures that must be utilized by affiliated institutes (HEC, 2020).

The curriculum and syllabi offered by the parent institution are typically the ones that are followed by affiliated colleges. This ensures that there is some degree of uniformity across all of the programs (Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, Pakistan, 2020). Examinations for colleges linked with a parent university are frequently administered by the parent university, which helps to ensure the fairness of the evaluation process.

For the purpose of maintaining high educational standards, the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan (HEC) establishes norms for quality assurance in colleges that are affiliated with the commission (HEC, 2022).

The significance of this research resides in the fact that it has the ability to provide light on the relationship between institutional autonomy and the national policy framework. It also offers insights that could aid the making of informed decisions by educational policymakers, administrators, and college leaders (Mushtaq & Khan, 2018). By carefully examining the degree to which the stated goals of connected colleges and the national education objectives are congruent with one another, we will be able to locate areas of synergy as well as potential gaps. This, in turn, can lead to the development of methods that enhance the efficiency with which education is delivered, stimulate innovation, and support the accomplishment of national educational ambitions (UNESCO, 2015). It is essential, for a number of reasons, that the goals of individual institutions and those of the national education programs be aligned. When the goals of educational institutions are in line with national policy, it makes it easier to provide high-quality education in a consistent manner. It guarantees that colleges contribute successfully to the accomplishment of national educational goals, leading to enhanced student outcomes and learning experiences as a result of their involvement (UNDP, 2019).

Through alignment, organizations are able to change their programs to meet the ever-evolving requirements of society, the economy, and the job market (Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, Pakistan, 2020). The graduates' employability and competitiveness are both improved as a result of this responsiveness.

Effective alignment guarantees that the objectives and approaches described in national education policies are transformed into concrete steps at the institutional level, which enhances the policy's ability to be put into effect (Hussain & Ali, 2018). A method that is aligned helps to efficiently allocate available resources. Initiatives that directly contribute to both an institution's own objectives and the objectives of national policy can be given priority by the institution. The alignment of institutions with national policies can have a favorable impact on the accreditation and recognition that institutions receive, which in turn fosters trust among stakeholders and prospective students (Mushtaq & Khan, 2018).

The objective of this research is to carry out an in-depth investigation on the degree to which Pakistani affiliated colleges and Pakistan's national education policy have a vision, mission, and set of goals that are congruent with one another. The purpose of this inquiry is to determine the extent to which the long-term goals of these educational institutions are aligned with the more general educational goals defined by the federal government. The purpose of this study is to provide insights into the efficiency with which policies are

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

implemented, to identify possible areas of synergy or discord, and to propose ways for improving the overall quality and relevance of education. These objectives will be accomplished by evaluating this alignment.

Research Objectives

The objective of this study was to examine and conduct an analysis of the vision, mission, and goals statements of a representative sample of colleges connected with Pakistan in order to determine the primary goals articulated by these institutions. Also, conduct a comparison analysis to evaluate the extent to which the established vision, mission and goals and the goals stipulated by national education policy are aligned with one another.

Research Questions

1. What are the core objectives articulated by a representative sample of Pakistani affiliated colleges as evident from their vision, mission, and goals statements?
2. To what extent do the identified institutional objectives align with the objectives stipulated by the national education policies of Pakistan through a comparative analysis?

Literature Review

In the highly competitive and ever-changing environment that is today's higher education system, safeguarding and preserving the quality of educational programs and services has emerged as one of the top priorities for educational institutions all over the world. Institutional Quality Assurance (QA) is a technique that educational institutions apply to ensure and increase the quality of their offerings, thereby aligning their aims with educational excellence and continual improvement (Bart, 1997). This approach is both comprehensive and systematic in nature. This proactive strategy encompasses a continual process of assessment, monitoring, evaluation, and enhancement to uphold the standards of the institution, meet the expectations of stakeholders, and contribute to the growth of educational practices (Brimble & Whiting, 2006).

The term "institutional quality assurance" refers to the structured processes and systems that are put into place by educational institutions in order to ensure and improve the overall quality of their business operations. It includes a wide variety of activities that include all aspects of the educational establishment, including as the development of curricula, the implementation of teaching strategies, the conduct of research, the provision of student services, and the operation of administrative procedures (Galleli et al., 2022). Establishing standards and benchmarks that are crystal clear and measurable, and that are in line with the missions of the respective institutions, the needs of the relevant regional accreditation bodies, and the generally accepted best practices in the field of higher education (Harvey & Green, 1993). Participating in stringent assessment and evaluation methods with the goal of measuring the performance of the institution in comparison to the criteria that have been set. This entails assessing the student learning outcomes, the effectiveness of the teaching, the impact of the research, and the success of the institution. The dedication to reaching for ever-higher standards of excellence should be considered one of the cornerstones of quality assurance in institutions (Hartnell et al., 2011). This entails using assessment data and comments to identify areas that could use improvement, and then designing plans for

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

addressing these identified areas once the areas of improvement have been identified. In order to evaluate the efficacy of their quality assurance procedures and the results of those procedures, institutions frequently carry out internal reviews that involve teachers, administrators, and employees. According to Naidoo (2019), an additional layer of examination can be added with the help of external reviews conducted by accrediting authorities, peers, or specialists.

By making evaluation methods and results available to stakeholders, quality assurance contributes to an environment that is more transparent. Because of this responsibility, establishments are certain to maintain their dedication to the quality improvement goals they have set (Harvey & Green, 1993; Hawkins, 2016).

One cannot overestimate the importance of ensuring the quality of higher education institutions through institutional quality assurance (HEC, 2020; 2017):

1. The methods of quality assurance guarantee that educational programs and services are up to, or even better than, the criteria that have been set, which ultimately results in educational excellence.
2. The ability of an institution to provide excellent education is bolstered when stakeholders, such as students, parents, employers, and funding agencies, have faith in the effectiveness of quality assurance practices used by the institution.
3. Numerous establishments aim to authenticate the quality of their programs by obtaining accreditation from various recognized organisations. The proof required for accreditation can be obtained through the use of quality assurance systems.
4. Data gathered for quality assurance make it possible for institutions to make informed decisions by illuminating both their existing strengths and potential areas for growth.
5. The methods of quality assurance allow for establishments to adjust to shifting educational, societal, and economic needs while yet maintaining a consistently high level of quality.
6. Institutions have the ability to improve both the learning outcomes for students and the overall educational experience by concentrating on continual development.

Several nations and geographic areas have adopted frameworks and rules with the purpose of ensuring the quality of institutions. For instance, the "UK Quality Code for Higher Education" of the United Kingdom sets standards for quality across a variety of operational domains of the institution (QAA, 2019). Accrediting bodies in the United States, such as the Middle States Commission on Higher Education, are responsible for establishing the criteria that must be met in order to get an institution's accreditation (MSCHE, 2014).

Globally, the success of higher education institutions is inextricably linked to the effectiveness of the institutional quality assurance programs. Institutions may ensure that they provide high-quality education, continue to be sensitive to the demands of stakeholders, and contribute to the advancement of education on a global scale if they adhere to defined standards, engage in rigorous assessment, and foster a culture of continuous improvement. The environment of higher education is always shifting, and as a result, the role of institutional quality assurance is becoming increasingly important in order to preserve excellence and relevance.

When it comes to the field of higher education, the vision, mission, and goals of an institution

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

serve as the foundational pillars that form the institution's identity, purpose, and direction. The institution's strategic planning, decision-making, and general trajectory may all be mapped out with the help of these components, which create a clear roadmap. The institution's objectives, values, and dedication to providing outstanding education are all encapsulated in the institution's vision, purpose, and goals statements. This piece digs into the significance of these guiding principles and investigates the role that they play in directing educational institutions toward achieving the highest possible standards (Kotter & Heskett, 1992).

A declaration that looks into the future and articulates the institution's ideal future condition or its broad goals is called an institutional vision. According to Hartnell et al. (2011), it provides a feeling of direction and inspiration to the institution's stakeholders by outlining what the institution hopes to accomplish in the long run.

The institution's mission statement should provide a clear and concise explanation of the organization's central goal, the principal activities it engages in, and the constituencies it serves. It describes the extent of the organization, its principles, and the distinctive contributions it makes to society (Bart, 1997).

The purpose and vision of an institution should be used to guide the development of specific goals that can be measured. These objectives serve as a blueprint for action and direct the strategic planning of the organization, so assisting in the process of translating the overarching mission and vision into measurable results (Bart, 1997).

Vision, mission, and goals provide a framework for aligning all elements of institutional activity with a shared sense of purpose. This includes the creation of curricula, the allocation of resources, and decision-making. These statements provide clarity and focus to all of the institution's stakeholders, directing them toward similar goals and ensuring that they are working together to accomplish the institution's mission (Malik, 2012).

A well-crafted vision statement can motivate stakeholders by providing a clear image of the direction in which the institution would want to go in the future. According to Hartnell et al. (2011), this type of inspiration can help to develop a sense of togetherness and motivation among the faculty, staff, and students. The decision-making process is guided by a combination of vision, mission, and goals. When presented with options, institutions are able to evaluate the various paths depending on the degree to which they conform to these guiding statements (Malik & Ameen, 2017).

Engaging stakeholders in meaningful conversation is a necessary step in the process of developing an effective vision, purpose, and goals. These statements are typically crafted in a collaborative process by committees or working groups that are convened by institutions. This helps to ensure that a variety of perspectives are taken into consideration. After they have been crafted, these statements ought to be disseminated broadly to all of the institution's stakeholders—including its students, teachers, staff, and external partners—in order to ensure that everyone has the same sense of where the institution is headed (Malik et al., 2010).

There are numerous formats available for organizing a vision, mission, and set of goals. Some educational establishments opt to highlight their contributions to research, community participation, or global citizenship, while others highlight their dedication to diversity, equity, and inclusion in their mission statements. The vision, mission, and goals of an educational

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

institution are more than just phrases; rather, they are a representation of the organization's own heart and soul (Zheng et al., 2021). They offer a road map that can be followed in order to achieve excellence, cultivate a feeling of community, and guide strategic activities. These statements are essential aspects that contribute considerably to the educational journey as well as the broader impact that institutions have on society. They have the potential to inspire, align, and direct (Middle States Commission on Higher Education, 2014).

Research Methodology

The fundamental objective of the research was to conduct an examination of the vision, mission, and goals statements of a representative sample of colleges associated with Pakistan in order to establish the primary aims that these institutions have set for themselves. The research was conducted using a hybrid strategy. The mixed method is a research strategy that combines quantitative and qualitative data in a single study. One strategy is to ask broad, introspective inquiries (qualitative method). The second strategy is the use of "close answer" questions (quantitative method). This research was descriptive in nature and employed a mixed-method technique to collect data from Pakistani universities and colleges. Quantitative (experiments, surveys) and qualitative (focus groups, interviews) data are collected, analyzed, and synthesized in mixed methods studies. A total of 1900 colleges in Pakistan are affiliated with various degree awarding institutions. Which 1351 colleges (1351 principals, 1351 directors of QEC and 36,648 faculty members) in Punjab, 258 colleges (258 principals, 258 directors of QEC and 7582 faculty members) in Sindh, 209 colleges (209 principals, 209 directors of QEC and 5674 faculty members) in KP, and 72 colleges (72 principals, 72 directors of QEC and 3212 faculty members) were in Balochistan. There were 1900 principals, 1900 directors of QEC and 53,116 faculty members in these colleges. Everyone who read this was included in the research. This method yielded a calculated population of 56,916. The sample was taken from Punjab, K.P., Baluchistan and Sindh. The sample of study consisted on One public University, including four affiliated Institutions from Baluchistan, One public University with four affiliated colleges from KPK, One public University and four affiliated colleges from Sindh and four public universities and sixteen affiliated colleges from Punjab.

Table 1: Sample Distributions Chart

Areas	Number of Affiliated Colleges	Number of Principals	Directors of QEC	Numbers of Faculty Members	Targeted Sample
Punjab	16	16	16	80	
Sindh	04	04	04	20	
KP	04	04	04	20	
Baluchistan	04	04	04	20	
Total	28	28	28	140	196

The questionnaires were used to determine the effectiveness of the parameters of modified Minimum Quality Standards of Higher Education Commission, (2017); moreover, the questionnaires were used to highlight/explore the deficient areas in MQS for further deliberation/incorporation. The questionnaires were administered to the principals and

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

faculty members of the affiliating colleges. One questionnaire for head faculty teachers of affiliated colleges of Pakistan. One interview protocol for principals of affiliated colleges of Pakistan and one interview protocol for QEC directors of Universities of Pakistan. Quantitative data must be properly coded before analysis can begin. This necessitated coding throughout the course of data collection and the beginning of data feeding in SPSS -21. Some information, however, was entered into the system after collecting was complete. The obtained data was analyzed using appropriate statistical techniques to ascertain the quality assurance procedures of affiliated and affiliating institutions. Percentages, means, and ANOVA were used to determine where administrators and instructors differed in their use of quality assurance procedures. During qualitative data collection, the information of a more subjective nature was gathered.

Results**Quantitative Results**

The ages of teachers in Pakistan's various provinces are broken down into years and presented in the table 1 below. Comparatively, just 5% of teaching staff in Punjab are within the age range of 25 to 30 years old, while this makes up 20% of Sindh's teaching force. In a similar vein, 15% of the teaching staff in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) are between the ages of 25 and 30, while in Balochistan, the same age range accounts for 15% of the teaching staff. Moving on to the age bracket of 31 to 35, Sindh has 30 percent of the teachers, Punjab has 16.25 percent, KPK has 35 percent, and Balochistan has 10 percent. 40 percent of persons aged 36 to 40 live in Balochistan, compared to 70 percent in Punjab, 25 percent in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province, and 40 percent in Sindh. The percentage of teachers older than 40 years old in Sindh is 10%, whereas the percentage in Punjab is 8.75%, KPK is 25%, and Balochistan is 35%. Overall, when all age groups are included, Sindh contributes 100 teachers (20%) to the total count of 140 instructors in the study, while Punjab contributes 80 teachers (100%), KPK contributes 20 teachers (100%), and Balochistan contributes 20 teachers (100%).

Table 1: Age (Year) Distribution of Teachers

	Sindh		Punjab		KPK		Balochistan		Total
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%	
25-30	4	20%	4	5%	3	15%	3	15%	14
31-35	6	30%	13	16.25%	7	35%	2	10%	28
36-40	8	40%	56	70%	5	25%	8	40%	77
> 40	2	10%	7	8.75%	5	25%	7	35%	21
Total	20	100%	80	100%	20	100%	20	100%	140

The educational credentials held by teachers in Pakistan's several provinces are presented in a comparative manner in Table 2, which may be found below. In Sindh, the percentage of teachers who have earned a Bachelor of Science (BS) degree is substantially higher at 35%, whereas in Punjab, it is much lower at 3.75%. While just 10% of instructors in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) hold a Bachelor of Science degree, 15% of teachers in Balochistan have earned this level of education. Moving on to the master's degree level, the percentage of teachers in Sindh who hold an MA or MSC is 40%, whilst in Punjab, the percentage of teachers

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

who hold this qualification is 81.25%. In KPK, fifty percent of the teaching staff has either a master's or a specialist's degree, while in Balochistan, that percentage is seventy percent. Sindh contributes 15% of those who have an M. Phil qualification, while Punjab contributes 8.75%, KPK contributes 25%, and Balochistan contributes 10%. In conclusion, Sindh has 10% of the country's teachers who hold a Ph.D., while Punjab has 6.25 percent, KPK has 15%, and Balochistan has only 5 percent. As part of the general allocation, Sindh provides 20 teachers to the total count of 140 teachers, whereas Punjab contributes 80 teachers to the whole count, KPK contributes 20 teachers to the entire count, and Balochistan contributes 20 teachers to the total count.

Table 2: Qualification of Teachers

	Sindh		Punjab		KPK		Balochistan		Total
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%	
BS	7	35%	3	3.75%	2	10%	3	15%	15
MA/MSc	8	40%	65	81.25%	10	50%	14	70%	97
M.Phil	3	15%	7	8.75%	5	25%	2	10%	17
Ph.D.	2	10%	5	6.25%	3	15%	1	05%	11
Total	20	100%	80	100%	20	100%	20	100%	140

The data contained in Table 3 provides a comparative analysis of the distribution of teachers across the various provinces of Pakistan based on the level of classes that they are engaged in teaching. The percentage of teachers that are active in the instruction of BA/BSC courses is 5% in Punjab but 10% in Sindh. In a same vein, 10% of instructors in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) and 15% of teachers in Balochistan are responsible for BA/BSC lessons. At the BS level, Sindh supplies 30 percent of the teachers, whereas Punjab gives 46.25 percent, KPK contributes 30 percent, and Balochistan contributes 30 percent. Sindh contributes 10% to the MA/MSc category, while Punjab contributes 6.25%, KPK contributes 15%, and Balochistan contributes 10%. At the secondary school level, 25% of teachers in Sindh, 33.75% of teachers in Punjab, 20% of teachers in KPK, and 20% of teachers in Balochistan are active. In terms of the number of professors who are qualified to teach M. Phil courses, Sindh has 15%, Punjab has 5%, KPK has 15%, and Balochistan has 10%. In conclusion, the percentage of professors holding a Ph.D. is as follows: Sindh has 10%, Punjab has 3.75%, KPK has 10%, and Balochistan has 15%. The cumulative view reveals that Sindh contributes 20 teachers to the total count of 140 teachers, whereas Punjab contributes 80 teachers to the whole count, KPK contributes 20 teachers to the total count, and Balochistan contributes 20 teachers to the entire count.

Table 3: Class Teaching

	Sindh		Punjab		KPK		Balochistan		Total
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%	
BA/BSC	2	10%	4	5%	2	10%	3	15%	11%
BS	6	30%	37	46.25%	6	30%	6	30%	55%
MA/MSc	2	10%	5	6.25%	3	15%	2	10%	12%
MS	5	25%	27	33.75%	4	20%	4	20%	40%
M.Phil	3	15%	4	5%	3	15%	2	10%	12%

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

Ph.D.	2	10%	3	3.75%	2	10%	3	15%	10%
Total	20	100%	80	100%	20	100%	20	100%	140

The data presented in Table 4 provides an illuminating breakdown of the number of years of teaching experience that instructors have in each of Pakistan's provinces. Twenty-five percent of teachers in Sindh have between one and five years of experience in the classroom, whereas just twenty percent of instructors in Punjab have the same amount of experience. The percentage of instructors who fall into this experience bracket is 20% in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK), whereas in Balochistan it is 10%. In the group of instructors with 6-10 years of experience, 20% of those teachers come from Sindh, while 30% come from Punjab, 30% come from KPK, and 15% come from Balochistan. In the range of 11-15 years of experience, Sindh accounts for 25% of teachers, Punjab for 23.75%, KPK for 25%, and Balochistan for an astonishing 50% of the country's educators. Sindh and Punjab both have 20% of the total workers who have between 16 and 20 years of experience, whereas KPK has 10% and Balochistan has 10%. The percentage of teachers in Sindh who have more than 20 years of experience is 10%, whereas the percentage in Punjab is 6.25%, KPK is 15%, and Balochistan is also 15%. When all of the different types of experience are taken into account, Sindh contributes 20 teachers to the total count of 140 instructors, Punjab contributes 80 teachers to the entire count, KPK contributes 20 teachers to the whole count, and Balochistan contributes 20 teachers to the total count.

Table 4: Teaching Experience (in Year)

	Sindh		Punjab		KPK		Balochistan		Total
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%	
1-5	5	25%	16	20%	4	20%	2	10%	27
6-10	4	20%	24	30%	6	30%	3	15%	37
11-15	5	25%	19	23.75%	5	25%	10	50%	39
16-20	4	20%	16	20%	2	10%	2	10%	24
> 20	2	10%	5	6.25%	3	15%	3	15%	13
Total	20	100%	80	100%	20	100%	20	100%	140

The data presented in Table 5 gives a detailed overview of the availability of a variety of resources to teachers in the province of Punjab in Pakistan. The accessibility of computers stands out among the available resources; 77 instructors, or about 96.25 percent, confirmed that they have access to computers, while only three teachers do not have access. A similar pattern can be seen with regard to the accessibility to the internet, as 76 teachers (or 95%) have confirmed that they have access, whilst only four teachers do not have access to this resource. Access to E-Data is similarly distributed, with 76 teachers (or 95%) having access and only 6 teachers being unable to get it.

In terms of e-books, 21 instructors, or 26.25 percent, have confirmed that they are accessible, while 9 teachers do not have access. It is interesting to note that access to the electronic library is relatively restricted, with only two teachers (2.5% of the total) indicating that they have access and a significant number of teachers (78) not having access. Reading resources, on the other hand, can be found in plenty within a physical library, since 79 teachers (or 98.75%) have confirmed that they have access to one.

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

The availability of conference rooms is extremely high, with 76 instructors (or 95%) claiming access, while only four teachers do not have it. In a similar vein, the availability of prayer areas and facilities has been confirmed by 79 instructors, which represents a confirmation rate of 98.75%. Notably, the majority of transportation facilities are accessible, as 87.5% of the teacher's report having access to them, while just 10% of the instructors do not have access. On the other hand, medical services appear to be more difficult to reach, as there was only one instructor who confirmed access (1.25%).

Table 5: What Resources are Accessible to Teachers (in Punjab)?

Resource	Yes	No	To Some Extent
Computer	77	3	0
Internet	76	4	0
E-Data	76	6	0
E-Book	21	9	0
E-Library	2	78	0
Reading in Library	79	1	0
Conference Room	76	4	0
Prayer Place	79	1	0
Transport Facility	70	10	0
Medical Facility	1	79	0
Hostel Facility	78	2	0

The data presented in Table 6 provides a detailed summary of the availability of a variety of resources for instructors working in Sindh, Pakistan. Four instructors, or twenty percent of the total, report having access to computers, whereas the remaining sixteen teachers do not have this resource. In a similar vein, only 2 teachers (10%) have acknowledged that they have access to the internet, whereas 18 teachers do not have this resource. Access to e-data follows the same pattern as the trend, with only two teachers (10%) reporting access and eighteen teachers lacking access.

Only one teacher, which accounts for 5% of all teachers, has access to electronic books, while the remaining 19 teachers do not. In a similar vein, access to the electronic library is restricted, with only two teachers (10%) claiming access and eighteen teachers not having access. Reading resources, on the other hand, can be found in plenty within a physical library; eighteen teachers, or eighty percent, have confirmed that they have access to one, while only four teachers do not.

The availability of conference rooms is quite high, as 16 teachers, or 80%, report having access to them, while just 4 teachers do not have access. In a similar vein, prayer spaces are easily accessible, as evidenced by the fact that 19 teachers (or 95%) have confirmed their availability, while only one teacher does not have access. Both ten teachers (fifty percent of the total) who report having access to transportation and the same number who do not have access are present. Only two teachers, or 10% of the total, have reported having access to medical facilities. This indicates that access to other resources is also limited.

Table 6: What Resources are Accessible to Teachers (Sindh)?

Resource	Yes	No	To Some Extent
Computer	4	16	0
Internet	2	18	0

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

E-Data	2	18	0
E-Book	1	19	0
E-Library	2	18	0
Reading in Library	16	04	0
Conference Room	16	04	0
Prayer Place	19	01	0
Transport Facility	10	10	0
Medical Facility	2	18	0
Hostel Facility	18	2	0

Table 7 presents an in-depth analysis of the availability of a variety of resources for instructors working in the province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK), Pakistan. Computer accessibility is one of the resources that has been verified by 12 teachers, accounting for 60% of the total, while 8 teachers do not have access. A similar pattern is shown with regard to internet access, with only four teachers (or 20%) indicating that they have access while sixteen teachers do not. Accessibility to e-data follows this pattern as well, with only three teachers (15%) reporting having access while seventeen teachers claiming they do not have access.

Only two teachers, or 10%, have confirmed that they have access to electronic books and libraries, whereas eighteen teachers do not have this access. On the other hand, reading resources that are housed within a physical library are easier to access, and ten teachers, which is fifty percent of the total, have confirmed that they have access, while the same number do not. The availability of conference rooms is quite high, with 17 instructors, or 85%, reporting access and only three teachers, or 15%, not having access. The availability of prayer spaces is attested to by twenty teachers, which constitutes one hundred percent of the sample. The availability of transport facilities is distributed evenly, with 10 instructors (or 50%) reporting access and an equal number indicating they do not have access. However, it would appear that none of the KPK teachers who were surveyed have access to medical services. In terms of lodging, there is a notable availability of hostel facilities; eighteen professors, which is ninety percent of the total, have confirmed their availability, while only two teachers do not have access.

Table 7: What Resources are Accessible to Teachers (in KPK)?

Resource	Yes	No	To Some Extent
Computer	12	8	0
Internet	4	16	0
E-Data	3	17	0
E-Book	2	18	0
E-Library	2	18	0
Reading in Library	10	10	0
Conference Room	17	3	0
Prayer Place	20	0	0
Transport Facility	10	10	0
Medical Facility	0	20	0

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

Hostel Facility	18	2	0
------------------------	----	---	---

The data presented in Table 8 provides an illuminating overview of the availability of a variety of resources for educators in the province of Balochistan in Pakistan. The accessibility of the computers is one of the resources that has been acknowledged by 15 percent of the teachers, while 17 teachers do not have access. This pattern is also reflected in the number of teachers who do not have access to the internet, which is 18, despite the fact that only 2 teachers (10%) admit having access. In a similar manner, only one teacher out of 20 teachers (5%) reports having access to E-Data, while the remaining 19 teachers do not.

None of the teachers who were surveyed have acknowledged that they have access to electronic books or an electronic library. Ten educators, which is fifty percent of the total, report having access to the reading resources housed within a physical library, and an equal number of educators do not have access. The availability of the conference room is approximately equal, as 10 instructors (representing 50%) have confirmed access and 10 teachers do not have access. The availability of prayer spaces is attested to by twenty teachers, which constitutes one hundred percent of the sample. Ten instructors, or fifty percent of the total, report having access to the available transportation facilities, while an equal number do not. However, none of the teachers in Balochistan that were polled had access to the available medical facilities. In terms of lodging, the accessibility of hostel facilities is particularly noteworthy, as 17 teachers, representing 85% of the total, have confirmed their availability, while only three teachers do not have access.

Table 8: What Resources are Accessible to Teachers (in Balochistan)?

Resource	Yes	No	To Some Extent
Computer	3	17	
Internet	2	18	
E-Data	1	19	
E-Book	0	20	
E-Library	0	20	
Reading in Library	10	10	
Conference Room	10	10	
Prayer Place	20	0	
Transport Facility	10	10	
Medical Facility	0	20	
Hostel Facility	17	3	

Table 9 gives a detailed summary of the distribution of perspectives on the alignment, understanding, and implementation of the vision, mission, and goals statements among the many affiliated colleges in Pakistan's major provinces. The colleges in Punjab have the highest mean score of 4.3 (standard deviation = 0.94) when it comes to having a written statement of vision, mission, and goals. Following closely behind are the colleges in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK), which have a mean score of 4.35 (standard deviation = 0.57). The mean scores for colleges located in Sindh and Balochistan are slightly lower, coming in at 3.25 (standard deviation = 0.71) and 2.6 (standard deviation = 1.04) respectively.

The colleges in KPK have the greatest mean score of 3.45 (SD = 0.68) when it comes to the comprehension of the vision, mission, and goals, while the colleges in Sindh, Punjab, and Balochistan have mean scores of 3.4 (SD = 0.75), 3.95 (SD = 0.81), and 2.4 (SD = 1.50)

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

accordingly. Moving on to the implementation of these claims, colleges in KPK once again hold the lead with a mean score of 4.1 (standard deviation equal to 1.02), followed by Punjab with a mean score of 3.94 (standard deviation equal to 0.90). The mean scores for Sindh and Balochistan are 3.25 (standard deviation = 1.33) and 2.3 (standard deviation = 1.08) respectively.

Colleges in the province of Punjab have the greatest mean score of 3.78 (standard deviation of 0.96), while colleges in the province of KPK have a mean score of 3.75 (standard deviation of 0.71) in terms of their alignment with the National Education Policy (NEP). The mean scores at colleges in Sindh and Balochistan are also lower, coming in at 2.9 (standard deviation = 1.25) and 2.0 (standard deviation = 0.85) respectively.

Table 9: Vision, Mission and Goals Distribution

	Sindh		Punjab		KPK		Balochistan	
	M	SD	M	SD	M	SD	M	SD
The College have a written statement of vision, mission and goals,	3.25	0.71	4.3	0.94	4.35	0.57	2.6	1.04
The vision, mission and goals of college are widely understood.	3.4	0.75	3.95	0.81	3.45	0.68	2.4	1.50
The vision, mission and goals of college are implemented.	3.25	1.33	3.94	0.90	4.1	1.02	2.3	1.08
The vision, mission and goals statement aligned with NEP.	2.9	1.25	3.78	0.96	3.75	0.71	2.0	0.85

SD = Standard Deviation

The findings of an analysis of variance (ANOVA) are shown in Table 10. The findings of the ANOVA show that the associated colleges of the various provinces have significantly varied mean scores for their perceptions. The largest sample size of 80 respondents can be found in Punjab, where the mean perception score is 3.98, indicating a rather high level of agreement on these claims. Punjab has the largest sample size. According to the confidence interval that covers 95% of the people in Punjab, the real mean of the population is somewhere between 3.86 and 4.11.

When compared to other colleges, those in Sindh had a significantly lower mean perception score of 3.20, with only 20 respondents making up the sample size. The level of diversity that may be found among the responses from Sindh is shown by the fact that the confidence interval for this province is between 2.93 and 3.46.

The sample size was twenty people, and the results showed that the province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) has a mean perception score of 3.91. The confidence interval (95%) ranges from 3.74 to 4.07, reflecting the possible boundaries of the true mean's location within this spectrum of numbers.

The colleges in Balochistan have the lowest mean perception score, coming in at 2.32 out of

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

a possible 10, which indicates a somewhat lower level of agreement with the vision, purpose, and goals statements. The fact that the confidence interval for Balochistan ranges from 2.01 to 2.63 exemplifies the level of variation that can be found within the results provided by this region. A mean perception score of 3.62 was calculated using data collected from all provinces (Total), with a standard deviation of 0.68 and a standard error of 0.06. The range of values that make up the confidence interval for the total score is 3.49 to 3.76.

Table 10: ANOVA

	N	Mean	SD	SE	95% C.I.	
					Lower	Upper
Punjab	80	3.98	.57	.06	3.86	4.11
Sindh	20	3.20	.55	.12	2.93	3.46
KPK	20	3.91	.35	.07	3.74	4.07
Balochistan	20	2.32	.65	.14	2.01	2.63
Total	140	3.62	.068	.06	3.49	3.76

SD = Standard Deviation, SE = Standard Error, C.I. = Confidence Interval

Principals and QEC Representatives' Qualitative Data

Table 11 illustrates the interviewee's suggestions about the most crucial problems related to the Vision, mission, and goal to achieve the minimum quality standards for colleges in Pakistan. They suggested that teachers' lack of motivational behaviour toward their students is the most crucial problem relating to the Vision, mission, and goals to achieve the minimum quality standards for colleges in Pakistan. Interviewees believed that a lack of visionary teaching missions and less learning are the most crucial problems relating to achieving the minimum requirements in Pakistan.

Table 11: Problems related to vision, mission, and goals to achieve the minimum quality standard for college in Pakistan

Word	Length	Count	Weighted Percentage (%)	Similar Words
Motivational	12	11	1.69	motivation, motivational
Activities	10	19	1.66	activities, application, assignment, cooperation, examination, orientation, presentation, stimulation
Management	10	6	0.92	management, mismanagement
Stimulation	11	11	0.92	stimulated, stimulation
Practically	11	6	0.77	cooperation, experienced, practically
Communicate Tion	13	6	0.61	application, communication, counseling, examination, presentation
Enforcement	11	3	0.46	enforcement, implementation
Inappropriate	13	3	0.46	inappropriate, inappropriateness

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

Determination	13	3	0.36	assignment, determination, determining
Institutions	12	2	0.31	institutions, university
Principals	10	2	0.31	Principals
Appropriate	11	2	0.23	appropriate, appropriates
Experience	10	2	0.23	experience, experienced
Assessment	10	1	0.15	Assessment
Considered	10	1	0.15	Considered
Environment	11	1	0.15	Environment
Guidelines	10	1	0.15	Guidelines
Passiveness	11	1	0.15	Passiveness
Prevailing	10	1	0.15	Prevailing
Theoretical	11	1	0.15	Theoretical
Traditional	11	1	0.15	Traditional
Miscommunication	16	1	0.15	Miscommunication

The table shows that the interviewees identified that College Education in Pakistan has the problem of lack of motivation, mission-less teaching, and goal-oriented learning prevailing. They mentioned that lack of motivation and goal-Oriented are the issues to achieve the minimum quality standard for colleges in Pakistan. The table shows interviewees have identified a lack of reinforcement, and traditional teaching methods still exist in colleges. They believed that Vision, mission, and goal-oriented teaching are not applied in colleges, which is the most crucial problem relating to achieving the minimum quality standard of college in Pakistan. The table shows that interviewees have feelings that Vision, mission, and goal are usually not followed to achieve the minimum quality standard of colleges in Pakistan.

Discussion

Tables 5, 6, 7 and 8 provide a comprehensive picture of the resources accessible to teachers in different provinces. It would appear that Punjab has a considerably higher accessibility to a variety of resources, including computers, the internet, and electronic resources. KPK comes in close behind, which demonstrates that there is an adequate supply of resources. Sindh and Balochistan, on the other hand, have some areas of concern. Because these provinces have restricted access to resources like medical facilities, electronic books, and electronic libraries, the educational experience and professional growth of teachers in these areas may be hindered.

According to the findings that are reported in Tables 9, there are significant variations in the ways in which colleges located in different provinces assess the degree to which their vision, mission, and goals statements are aligned with one another, understood, and put into practice. The results show that Punjab is the province that has the greatest mean scores across these parameters, indicating that the colleges in this region have a better level of agreement and understanding with one another. This may be attributable to the emphasis placed on institutional governance and planning in Punjab, which has resulted in improved

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

clarity of communication and more effective application of these guiding statements. Additionally, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) exhibits comparatively positive mean ratings, which indicates a high alignment with the vision, purpose, and goals. On the other hand, Sindh and Balochistan had lower mean ratings, which suggests that these provinces could benefit from increased efforts to communicate, align, and successfully implement these assertions. The findings of the ANOVA, which are presented in Table 10, provide more evidence that the provinces' perception scores differ significantly from one another. The comparatively higher perception scores that Punjab received could be ascribed to the state having a more developed educational infrastructure as well as stronger institutional governance. On the other hand, Sindh and Baluchistan's lower scores could be an indication of issues in resource allocation, policy execution, and governance, which could potentially contribute to a difference in the quality of education among the provinces. These findings have major repercussions for both the formulation of policies and the organization of educational programs. Provinces with lower perception scores may require focused interventions to increase the alignment of institutional aims with national policies and to improve the availability of key resources. These provinces' scores were determined based on a survey that asked residents to rate their perceptions on a variety of factors. Improving access to resources and bolstering communication and implementation of declarations of vision, mission, and goals can both contribute to an overall improvement in the quality of education provided in these provinces.

Conclusion

The study found that different provinces had differing degrees of concordance between the goals of their educational institutions and the policies of the national education system. Both Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) displayed a closer alignment with one another as well as a deeper grasp of their own visions, missions, and goals, which may indicate more successful policy implementation and governance systems. In contrast, Sindh and Balochistan both displayed somewhat lower alignment scores, which suggests that there is space for improvement in communication, coordination, and the implementation of policies. Access to resources, an essential component in determining educational quality, was another aspect that varied significantly between regions. While KPK displayed impressive access to resources, Punjab emerged as a province with relatively higher accessibility to resources such as computers, the internet, and E-Books. Punjab was the province with the highest overall accessibility to resources. However, Sindh and Balochistan trailed behind, notably in areas such as medical facilities and electronic resources. These highlights significant differences in the educational experience and professional development of teachers in those two provinces. The study's critical aspect was finding out how affiliated colleges followed the minimum quality standards. It was found that vision, mission, and goal-oriented teaching-learning did not achieve the minimum quality standard regarding quality assurance. It was to determine how much focus was given to following the first standard; the same statement was also said by (Gilani, 2015). There was a significant gap regarding achieving the vision mission goal. It was found that teachers did not follow the visionary concept of teaching. Through the principals and QEC director, it was found that currently, teachers had no ambitious approach in teaching as well, as students were also found mission fewer learners.

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

It was found that teachers did not incorporate goal-oriented behaviour among the students. In response, the principals admitted that they were unaware of how mission, vision, and goal-oriented could be created in their institutions. In another dimension, QEC directors revealed that university education is more visionary, mission-based, and goal-oriented than affiliated colleges regarding quality assurance. One of the important to find out the behavior of principals and teachers toward achieving the mission statement.

Recommendation

On the basis of the findings and conclusions of this study, a number of suggestions and potential future directions can be given to address the observed discrepancies and improve the quality of education in Pakistani affiliated colleges, including the following:

1. It is important for institutes to place a primary emphasis on better aligning their vision, mission, and goals with the educational policies of the nation. This may require conducting regular reviews, consulting with relevant stakeholders, and making necessary changes in order to guarantee that the goals of the institution continue to align with the ever-evolving interests of the nation.
2. Establish efficient communication channels in order to ensure that all stakeholders, including students, teachers, and staff, as well as administration, have a complete comprehension of the guiding statements of the institution. This process can be made easier with the help of consistent workshops, seminars, and awareness initiatives.
3. In order to guarantee that all of the provinces' residents have the same level of access to vital resources like computers, the internet, libraries, and medical services, policymakers should devote an adequate amount of funding to this endeavor. The existence of resource gaps in Sindh and Balochistan points to the necessity of conducting targeted interventions.
4. Investing in digital infrastructure, such as electronic books and libraries, can help close the resource gap and create a learning environment that is more technologically advanced.
5. The development of faculty members should be a top priority for institutes in order to improve faculty members' comprehension of vision, mission and goals and the ability of faculty members to put those goals into practice. Training, seminars, and workshops are some of the ways this can be accomplished.
6. In order to contribute to a more robust education ecosystem, it is important to encourage collaboration across educational institutions and bodies. This will allow for the sharing of best practices and creative teaching approaches.
7. Establish systems for ongoing monitoring and evaluation of an institution's conformity with national policy and the availability of resources. This can be helpful in determining areas for improvement as well as tracking progress over time.
8. In order to cultivate healthy competition and push for ongoing development, associated colleges should be encouraged to engage in peer reviews and benchmarking.
9. Provinces like Balochistan that have lower scores in terms of resource accessibility and alignment should receive further focus and consideration. Implement targeted activities with the goal of closing educational achievement inequalities and ensuring that all students and educators have access to equitable educational opportunities.
10. Carry out research that follow subjects over time in order to monitor how alignment,

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

perception, and resource availability change over time. This can provide extremely significant data regarding the effectiveness of policy changes and actions.

11. In order to resolve regional inequities, improve procedures for resource allocation, and assure the successful execution of vision, purpose, and goals across provinces, policymakers should consider refining and revising national education policies.

References

1. Al-Qayoudhi, S., Hussaini, S. S., & Khan, F. R. (2017). Application of total quality management (tqm) in higher education institution (hei) in oman: shinas college of technology-A case study. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews eISSN*, 2395-6518.
2. Bart, C. K. (1997). The Relationship between Mission Statements and Firm Performance: An Exploratory Study. *Journal of Management Studies*, 34(5), 723-747.
3. Brimble, M., & Whiting, R. H. (2006). Institutional Mission and Students' Educational Outcomes: A Test of "Alignment" in Higher Education. *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management*, 28(1), 17-30.
4. Galleli, B., Teles, N. E. B., Santos, J. A. R. D., Freitas-Martins, M. S., & Hourneaux Junior, F. (2022). Sustainability university rankings: a comparative analysis of UI green metric and the times higher education world university rankings. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, 23(2), 404-425.
5. Government of Pakistan. (2009). National Education Policy 2009. *Ministry of Education*, Government of Pakistan.
6. Hartnell, C. A., Ou, A. Y., & Kinicki, A. (2011). Organizational Culture and Organizational Effectiveness: A Meta-Analytic Investigation of the Competing Values Framework's Theoretical Suppositions. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 96(4), 677-694.
7. Harvey, L., & Green, D. (1993). Defining Quality. Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education, 18(1), 9-34.
8. Hawkins, J. N. (2016). Framing essay education in the Asia-Pacific region: Historical context. *The Palgrave handbook of Asia Pacific higher education*, 5-23.
9. HEC Pakistan. (2017). HEC Vision 2025: A New Horizon of Excellence. *Higher Education Commission*, Government of Pakistan.
10. Higher Education Commission (HEC) Pakistan. (2020). HEC Ordinance 2002.
11. Hussain, I., & Ali, S. (2018). Alignment of Higher Education Institutions' Missions and Strategic Plans with the United Arab Emirates' National Agenda. *Studies in Higher Education*, 43(11), 1988-2002.
12. Kotter, J. P., & Heskett, J. L. (1992). Corporate Culture and Performance. Free Press.
13. Kousar, R., & Asif, M. (2015). Analysis of Vision and Mission Statements of HEC and Universities in Pakistan in Comparison with QS World Ranked Universities. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 6(6), 51-57.
14. Malik, A. H. (2012). *A Comparative Study of Elite-English-Medium Schools, Public Schools, and Islamic Madaris in Contemporary Pakistan: The Use of Pierre Bourdieu's Theory to Understand "Inequalities in Educational and Occupational Opportunities"*. University of Toronto (Canada).
15. Malik, A., & Ameen, K. (2017). Library/data education programs in Pakistan: a comparison with IFLA Guidelines. *Library Review*, 66(4/5), 297-309.
16. Malik, M. E., Nawab, S., Naeem, B., & Danish, R. Q. (2010). Job satisfaction and organizational commitment of university teachers in public sector of Pakistan. *International journal of business and management*, 5(6), 17.
17. Middle States Commission on Higher Education. (2014). Characteristics of Excellence in Higher Education: Requirements of Affiliation and Standards for Accreditation.

Comparative Analysis of Institutional Vision, Mission, and Goals Alignment...

18. Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, Pakistan. (2020). Education Statistics 2019-20.
19. Mushtaq, S., & Khan, M. T. (2018). Policy Implementation in Pakistan: A Case of Higher Education Commission. *South Asian Studies*, 33(2), 155-167.
20. Naidoo, V. (2019). Quality Assurance in Higher Education: Global Practices and Trends. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 68, 87-95.
21. National Association of College and University Business Officers (NACUBO). (2021). Best Practices for Developing a Mission Statement.
22. Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (QAA). (2019). The UK Quality Code for Higher Education.
23. UNESCO. (2015). Education 2030 Incheon Declaration and Framework for Action. United Nations Educational, *Scientific and Cultural Organization*.
24. United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). (2019). National Human Development Report 2017: *Unlocking the Potential of a Young Pakistan*.
25. Zheng, M., Bender, D., & Lyon, C. (2021). Online learning during COVID-19 produced equivalent or better student course performance as compared with pre-pandemic: empirical evidence from a school-wide comparative study. *BMC medical education*, 21, 1-11.